

procedures, descriptions of forms available, instruction as to the scope and contents of papers, reports, or examinations, and any amendment, revision, or report of the aforementioned.

Subpart C—Exemptions

§ 286.11 General provisions.

Records that meet the exemption criteria of the FOIA may be withheld from public disclosure and need not be published in the FEDERAL REGISTER, made available in a library reading room, or provided in response to a FOIA request.

§ 286.12 Exemptions.

The following types of records may be withheld in whole or in part from public disclosure under the FOIA, unless otherwise prescribed by law: A discretionary release of a record (see also § 286.4(e)) to one requester shall prevent the withholding of the same record under a FOIA exemption if the record is subsequently requested by someone else. However, a FOIA exemption may be invoked to withhold information that is similar or related that has been the subject of a discretionary release. In applying exemptions, the identity of the requester and the purpose for which the record is sought are irrelevant with the exception that an exemption may not be invoked where the particular interest to be protected is the requester's interest. However, if the subject of the record is the requester for the record and the record is contained in a Privacy Act system of records, it may only be denied to the requester if withholding is both authorized by DoD 5400.11-R⁴ and by a FOIA exemption.

(a) *Number 1 (5 U.S.C. 552(b)(1))*. Those properly and currently classified in the interest of national defense or foreign policy, as specifically authorized under the criteria established by Executive Order and implemented by regulations, such as DoD 5200.1-R.⁵ Although material is not classified at the time of the FOIA request, a classification review may be undertaken to determine whether the information should be

classified. The procedures in DoD 5200.1-R apply. If the information qualifies as exemption 1 information, there is no discretion regarding its release. In addition, this exemption shall be invoked when the following situations are apparent:

(1) The fact of the existence or non-existence of a record would itself reveal classified information. In this situation, Components shall neither confirm nor deny the existence or non-existence of the record being requested. A "refusal to confirm or deny" response must be used consistently, not only when a record exists, but also when a record does not exist. Otherwise, the pattern of using a "no record" response when a record does not exist, and a "refusal to confirm or deny" when a record does exist will itself disclose national security information.

(2) Compilations of items of information that are individually unclassified may be classified if the compiled information reveals additional association or relationship that meets the standard for classification under an existing executive order for classification and DoD 5200.1-R, and is not otherwise revealed in the individual items of information.

(b) *Number 2 (5 U.S.C. 552(b)(2))*. Those related solely to the internal personnel rules and practices of the Department of Defense or any of its Components. This exemption is entirely discretionary. This exemption has two profiles, high (b)(2) and low (b)(2). Paragraph (b)(2) of this section contains a brief discussion on the low (b)(2) profile; however, that discussion is for information purposes only. When only a minimum Government interest would be affected (administrative burden), there is a great potential for discretionary disclosure of the information. Consequently, DoD Components shall not invoke the low (b)(2) profile.

(1) Records qualifying under high (b)(2) are those containing or constituting statutes, rules, regulations, orders, manuals, directives, instructions, and security classification guides, the release of which would allow circumvention of these records thereby substantially hindering the effective performance of a significant function

⁴ See footnote 1 to § 286.1(a).

⁵ See footnote 1 to § 286.1(a).

of the Department of Defense. Examples include:

(i) Those operating rules, guidelines, and manuals for DoD investigators, inspectors, auditors, and examiners that must remain privileged in order for the DoD Component to fulfill a legal requirement.

(ii) Personnel and other administrative matters, such as examination questions and answers used in training courses or in the determination of the qualifications of candidates for employment, entrance on duty, advancement, or promotion.

(iii) Computer software, the release of which would allow circumvention of a statute or DoD rules, regulations, orders, manuals, directives, or instructions. In this situation, the use of the software must be closely examined to ensure a circumvention possibility exists.

(2) Records qualifying under the low (b)(2) profile are those that are trivial and housekeeping in nature for which there is no legitimate public interest or benefit to be gained by release, and it would constitute an administrative burden to process the request in order to disclose the records. Examples include rules of personnel's use of parking facilities or regulation of lunch hours, statements of policy as to sick leave, and administrative data such as file numbers, mail routing stamps, initials, data processing notations, brief references to previous communications, and other like administrative markings. DoD Components shall not invoke the low (b)(2) profile.

(c) *Number 3 (5 U.S.C. 552(b)(3))*. Those concerning matters that a statute specifically exempts from disclosure by terms that permit no discretion on the issue, or in accordance with criteria established by that statute for withholding or referring to particular types of matters to be withheld. The Directorate for Freedom of Information and Security Review maintains a list of (b)(3) statutes used within the Department of Defense, and provides updated lists of these statutes to DoD Components on a periodic basis. A few examples of such statutes are:

(1) *Patent Secrecy*, 35 U.S.C. 181–188. Any records containing information relating to inventions that are the sub-

ject of patent applications on which Patent Secrecy Orders have been issued.

(2) *Restricted Data and Formerly Restricted Data*, 42 U.S.C. 2162.

(3) *Communication Intelligence*, 18 U.S.C. 798.

(4) *Authority to Withhold From Public Disclosure Certain Technical Data*, 10 U.S.C. 130 and DoD Directive 5230.25.⁶

(5) *Confidentiality of Medical Quality Assurance Records: Qualified Immunity for Participants*, 10 U.S.C. 1102f.

(6) *Physical Protection of Special Nuclear Material: Limitation on Dissemination of Unclassified Information*, 10 U.S.C. 128.

(7) *Protection of Intelligence Sources and Methods*, 50 U.S.C. 403–3(c)(6).

(8) *Protection of Contractor Submitted Proposals*, 10 U.S.C. 2305(g).

(9) *Procurement Integrity*, 41 U.S.C. 423.

(d) *Number 4 (5 U.S.C. 552(b)(4))*. Those containing trade secrets or commercial or financial information that a DoD Component receives from a person or organization outside the Government with the understanding that the information or record will be retained on a privileged or confidential basis in accordance with the customary handling of such records. Records within the exemption must contain trade secrets, or commercial or financial records, the disclosure of which is likely to cause substantial harm to the competitive position of the source providing the information; impair the Government's ability to obtain necessary information in the future; or impair some other legitimate Government interest. Commercial or financial information submitted on a voluntary basis, absent any exercised authority prescribing criteria for submission is protected without any requirement to show competitive harm (see paragraph (d)(8) of this section). If the information qualifies as exemption 4 information, there is no discretion in its release. Examples include:

(1) Commercial or financial information received in confidence in connection with loans, bids, contracts, or proposals set forth in or incorporated by

⁶See footnote 1 to § 286.1(a).

reference in a contract entered into between the DoD Component and the offeror that submitted the proposal, as well as other information received in confidence or privileged, such as trade secrets, inventions, discoveries, or other proprietary data. See also § 286.23(h)(2) of this part. Additionally, when the provisions of 10 U.S.C. 2305(g), and 41 U.S.C. 423 are met, certain proprietary and source selection information may be withheld under exemption 3.

(2) Statistical data and commercial or financial information concerning contract performance, income, profits, losses, and expenditures, if offered and received in confidence from a contractor or potential contractor.

(3) Personal statements given in the course of inspections, investigations, or audits, when such statements are received in confidence from the individual and retained in confidence because they reveal trade secrets or commercial or financial information normally considered confidential or privileged.

(4) Financial data provided in confidence by private employers in connection with locality wage surveys that are used to fix and adjust pay schedules applicable to the prevailing wage rate of employees within the Department of Defense.

(5) Scientific and manufacturing processes or developments concerning technical or scientific data or other information submitted with an application for a research grant, or with a report while research is in progress.

(6) Technical or scientific data developed by a contractor or subcontractor exclusively at private expense, and technical or scientific data developed in part with Federal funds and in part at private expense, wherein the contractor or subcontractor has retained legitimate proprietary interests in such data in accordance with 10 U.S.C. 2320–2321 and DoD Federal Acquisition Regulation Supplement (DFARS), Chapter 2 of 48 CFR, Subpart 227.71–227.72. Technical data developed exclusively with Federal funds may be withheld under Exemption Number 3 if it meets the criteria of 10 U.S.C. 130 and DoD Directive 5230.25 (see paragraph (c)(4) of this section).

(7) Computer software which is copyrighted under the Copyright Act of 1976 (17 U.S.C. 106), the disclosure of which would have an adverse impact on the potential market value of a copyrighted work.

(8) Proprietary information submitted strictly on a voluntary basis, absent any exercised authority prescribing criteria for submission. Examples of exercised authorities prescribing criteria for submission are statutes, Executive Orders, regulations, invitations for bids, requests for proposals, and contracts. Submission of information under these authorities is not voluntary. (See also § 286.23(h)(3).)

(e) *Number 5 (5 U.S.C. 552(b)(5))*. Those containing information considered privileged in litigation, primarily under the deliberative process privilege. Except as provided in paragraphs (e)(2) through (e)(5) of this section, internal advice, recommendations, and subjective evaluations, as contrasted with factual matters, that are reflected in deliberative records pertaining to the decision-making process of an agency, whether within or among agencies (as defined in 5 U.S.C. 552(e)), or within or among DoD Components. In order to meet the test of this exemption, the record must be both deliberative in nature, as well as part of a decision-making process. Merely being an internal record is insufficient basis for withholding under this exemption. Also potentially exempted are records pertaining to the attorney-client privilege and the attorney work-product privilege. This exemption is entirely discretionary.

(1) Examples of the deliberative process include:

(i) The non factual portions of staff papers, to include after-action reports, lessons learned, and situation reports containing staff evaluations, advice, opinions, or suggestions.

(ii) Advice, suggestions, or evaluations prepared on behalf of the Department of Defense by individual consultants or by boards, committees, councils, groups, panels, conferences, commissions, task forces, or other similar groups that are formed for the purpose of obtaining advice and recommendations.

(iii) Those non factual portions of evaluations by DoD Component personnel of contractors and their products.

(iv) Information of a speculative, tentative, or evaluative nature or such matters as proposed plans to procure, lease or otherwise acquire and dispose of materials, real estate, facilities or functions, when such information would provide undue or unfair competitive advantage to private personal interests or would impede legitimate government functions.

(v) Trade secret or other confidential research development, or commercial information owned by the Government, where premature release is likely to affect the Government's negotiating position or other commercial interest.

(vi) Those portions of official reports of inspection, reports of the Inspector General, audits, investigations, or surveys pertaining to safety, security, or the internal management, administration, or operation of one or more DoD Components, when these records have traditionally been treated by the courts as privileged against disclosure in litigation.

(vii) Planning, programming, and budgetary information that is involved in the defense planning and resource allocation process.

(2) If any such intra- or inter-agency record or reasonably segregable portion of such record hypothetically would be made available routinely through the discovery process in the course of litigation with the Agency, then it should not be withheld under the FOIA. If, however, the information hypothetically would not be released at all, or would only be released in a particular case during civil discovery where a party's particularized showing of need might override a privilege, then the record may be withheld. Discovery is the formal process by which litigants obtain information from each other for use in the litigation. Consult with legal counsel to determine whether exemption 5 material would be routinely made available through the discovery process.

(3) Intra- or inter-agency memoranda or letters that are factual, or those reasonably segregable portions that are factual, are routinely made available

through discovery, and shall be made available to a requester, unless the factual material is otherwise exempt from release, inextricably intertwined with the exempt information, so fragmented as to be uninformative, or so redundant of information already available to the requester as to provide no new substantive information.

(4) A direction or order from a superior to a subordinate, though contained in an internal communication, generally cannot be withheld from a requester if it constitutes policy guidance or a decision, as distinguished from a discussion of preliminary matters or a request for information or advice that would compromise the decision-making process.

(5) An internal communication concerning a decision that subsequently has been made a matter of public record must be made available to a requester when the rationale for the decision is expressly adopted or incorporated by reference in the record containing the decision.

(f) *Number 6 (5 U.S.C. 552(b)(6))*. Information in personnel and medical files, as well as similar personal information in other files, that, if disclosed to a requester, other than the person about whom the information is about, would result in a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy. Release of information about an individual contained in a Privacy Act System of records that would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of privacy is prohibited, and could subject the releaser to civil and criminal penalties. If the information qualifies as exemption 6 information, there is no discretion in its release.

(1) Examples of other files containing personal information similar to that contained in personnel and medical files include:

(i) Those compiled to evaluate or adjudicate the suitability of candidates for civilian employment or membership in the Armed Forces, and the eligibility of individuals (civilian, military, or contractor employees) for security clearances, or for access to particularly sensitive classified information.

(ii) Files containing reports, records, and other material pertaining to personnel matters in which administrative action, including disciplinary action, may be taken.

(2) Home addresses, including private e-mail addresses, are normally not releasable without the consent of the individuals concerned. This includes lists of home addresses and military quarters' addresses without the occupant's name. Additionally, the names and duty addresses (postal and/or e-mail) of DoD military and civilian personnel who are assigned to units that are sensitive, routinely deployable, or stationed in foreign territories can constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.

(i) *Privacy interest.* A privacy interest may exist in personal information even though the information has been disclosed at some place and time. If personal information is not freely available from sources other than the Federal Government, a privacy interest exists in its nondisclosure. The fact that the Federal Government expended funds to prepare, index and maintain records on personal information, and the fact that a requester invokes FOIA to obtain these records indicates the information is not freely available.

(ii) Names and duty addresses (postal and/or e-mail) published in telephone directories, organizational charts, rosters and similar materials for personnel assigned to units that are sensitive, routinely deployable, or stationed in foreign territories are withholdable under this exemption.

(3) This exemption shall not be used in an attempt to protect the privacy of a deceased person, but it may be used to protect the privacy of the deceased person's family if disclosure would rekindle grief, anguish, pain, embarrassment, or even disruption of peace of mind of surviving family members. In such situations, balance the surviving family members' privacy against the public's right to know to determine if disclosure is in the public interest. Additionally, the deceased's social security number should be withheld since it is used by the next of kin to receive benefits. Disclosures may be made to

the immediate next of kin as defined in DoD Directive 5154.24.⁷

(4) A clearly unwarranted invasion of the privacy of third parties identified in a personnel, medical or similar record constitutes a basis for deleting those reasonably segregable portions of that record. When withholding third party personal information from the subject of the record and the record is contained in a Privacy Act system of records, consult with legal counsel.

(5) This exemption also applies when the fact of the existence or nonexistence of a responsive record would itself reveal personally private information, and the public interest in disclosure is not sufficient to outweigh the privacy interest. In this situation, DoD Components shall neither confirm nor deny the existence or nonexistence of the record being requested. This is a Glomar response, and exemption 6 must be cited in the response. Additionally, in order to insure personal privacy is not violated during referrals, DoD Components shall coordinate with other DoD Components or Federal Agencies before referring a record that is exempt under the Glomar concept.

(i) A "refusal to confirm or deny" response must be used consistently, not only when a record exists, but also when a record does not exist. Otherwise, the pattern of using a "no records" response when a record does not exist and a "refusal to confirm or deny" when a record does exist will itself disclose personally private information.

(ii) Refusal to confirm or deny should not be used when:

(A) The person whose personal privacy is in jeopardy has provided the requester a waiver of his or her privacy rights.

(B) The person initiated or directly participated in an investigation that lead to the creation of any agency record seeks access to that record.

(C) The person whose personal privacy is in jeopardy is deceased, the Agency is aware of that fact, and disclosure would not invade the privacy of the deceased's family. See paragraph (f)(3) of this section.

⁷ See footnote 1 to § 286.1(a).

(g) *Number 7 (5 U.S.C. 552(b)(7))*. Records or information compiled for law enforcement purposes; i.e., civil, criminal, or military law, including the implementation of Executive orders or regulations issued pursuant to law. This exemption may be invoked to prevent disclosure of documents not originally created for, but later gathered for law enforcement purposes. With the exception of parts (C) and (F) (see paragraph (g)(1)(iii) of this section) of this exemption, this exemption is discretionary. If information qualifies as exemption (7)(C) or (7)(F) (see paragraph (g)(1)(iii) of this section) information, there is no discretion in its release.

(1) This exemption applies, however, only to the extent that production of such law enforcement records or information could result in the following:

(i) Could reasonably be expected to interfere with enforcement proceedings (5 U.S.C. 552(b)(7)(A)).

(ii) Would deprive a person of the right to a fair trial or to an impartial adjudication (5 U.S.C. 552(b)(7)(B)).

(iii) Could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy of a living person, including surviving family members of an individual identified in such a record (5 U.S.C. 552(b)(7)(C)).

(A) this exemption also applies when the fact of the existence or nonexistence of a responsive record would itself reveal personally private information, and the public interest in disclosure is not sufficient to outweigh the privacy interest. In this situation, Components shall neither confirm nor deny the existence or nonexistence of the record being requested. This a Glomar response, and exemption (7)(C) must be cited in the response. Additionally, in order to insure personal privacy is not violated during referrals, DoD Components shall coordinate with other DoD Components or Federal Agencies before referring a record that is exempt under the Glomar concept.

(B) A “refusal to confirm or deny” response must be used consistently, not only when a record exists, but also when a record does not exist. Otherwise, the pattern of using a “no records” response when a record does not exist and a “refusal to confirm or

deny” when a record does exist will itself disclose personally private information.

(C) Refusal to confirm or deny should not be used when:

(1) The person whose personal privacy is in jeopardy has provided the requester with a waiver of his or her privacy rights.

(2) The person whose personal privacy is in jeopardy is deceased, and the Agency is aware of that fact.

(D) Could reasonably be expected to disclose the identity of a confidential source, including a source within the Department of Defense; a State, local, or foreign agency or authority; or any private institution that furnishes the information on a confidential basis; and could disclose information furnished from a confidential source and obtained by a criminal law enforcement authority in a criminal investigation or by an agency conducting a lawful national security intelligence investigation (5 U.S.C. 552(b)(7)(D)).

(E) Would disclose techniques and procedures for law enforcement investigations or prosecutions, or would disclose guidelines for law enforcement investigations or prosecutions if such disclosure could reasonably be expected to risk circumvention of the law (5 U.S.C. 552(b)(7)(E)).

(F) Could reasonably be expected to endanger the life or physical safety of any individual (5 U.S.C. 552(b)(7)(F)).

(2) Some examples of exemption 7 are:

(i) Statements of witnesses and other material developed during the course of the investigation and all materials prepared in connection with related Government litigation or adjudicative proceedings.

(ii) The identify of firms or individuals being investigated for alleged irregularities involving contracting with the Department of Defense when no indictment has been obtained nor any civil action filed against them by the United States.

(iii) Information obtained in confidence, expressed or implied, in the course of a criminal investigation by a criminal law enforcement agency or office within a DoD Component, or a lawful national security intelligence investigation conducted by an authorized

Office of the Secretary of Defense

§ 286.22

agency or office with a DoD Component. National security intelligence investigations include background security investigations and those investigations conducted for the purpose of obtaining affirmative or counterintelligence information.

(3) The right of individual litigants to investigative records currently available by law (such as, the Jencks Act, 18 U.S.C. 3500) is not diminished.

(4) *Exclusions.* Excluded from exemption 7 are the following two situations applicable to the Department of Defense. (Components considering invoking an exclusion should first consult with the Department of Justice, Office of Information and Privacy.):

(i) Whenever a request is made that involves access to records or information compiled for law enforcement purposes, and the investigation or proceeding involves a possible violation of criminal law where there is reason to believe that the subject of the investigation or proceeding is unaware of its pendency, and the disclosure of the existence of the records could reasonably be expected to interfere with enforcement proceedings, Components may, during only such times as that circumstances continues, treat the records of information as not subject to the FOIA. In such situation, the response to the requester will state that no records were found.

(ii) Whenever informant records maintained by a criminal law enforcement organization within a DoD Component under the informant's name or personal identifier are requested by a third party using the informant's name or personal identifier, the Component may treat the records as not subject to the FOIA, unless the informant's status as an informant has been officially confirmed. If it is determined that the records are not subject to 5 U.S.C. 552(b)(7), the response to the request will state that no records were found.

(h) *Number 8 (U.S.C. 552 (b)(8)).* Those contained in or related to examination, operation or condition reports prepared by, on behalf of, or for the use of any agency responsible for the regulation or supervision of financial institutions.

(i) *Number 9 (5 U.S.C. 552(b)(9)).* Those containing geological and geophysical

information and data (including maps) concerning wells.

Subpart D [Reserved]

Subpart E—Release and Processing Procedures

§ 286.22 General provisions.

(a) *Public information.* (1) Since the policy of the Department of Defense is to make the maximum amount of information available to the public consistent with its other responsibilities, written requests for a DoD record made under the provisions of 5 U.S.C. 552(a)(3) of the FOIA may be denied only when:

(i) Disclosure would result in a foreseeable harm to an interest protected by a FOIA exemption, and the record is subject to one or more of the exemptions of FOIA.

(ii) The record has not been described well enough to enable the DoD Component to locate it with a reasonable amount of effort by an employee familiar with the files.

(iii) The requester has failed to comply with the procedural requirements, including the written agreement to pay or payment of any required fee imposed by the instructions of the DoD Component concerned. When personally identifiable information in a record is requested by the subject of the record or the subject's attorney, notarization of the request, or a statement certifying under the penalty of perjury that their identity is true and correct may be required. Additionally, written consent of the subject of the record is required for disclosure from a Privacy Act System of records, even to the subject's attorney.

(2) Individuals seeking DoD information should address their FOIA requests to one of the addresses listed in appendix B of this part.

(b) *Requests from private parties.* The provisions of the FOIA are reserved for persons with private interest as opposed to U.S. Federal Agencies seeking official information. Requests from private persons will be made in writing, and should clearly show all other addressees within the Federal Government to which the request was also